

Chairman Wm. Weston J. Newton

*First Vice-Chair:
Laurie Slade Funderburk*

Legislative Oversight Committee



*William K. (Bill) Bowers
Raye Felder
Phyllis J. Henderson
Mia S. McLeod
Ralph W. Norman
Robert L. Ridgeway III
James E. Smith, Jr.
Edward R. Tallon Sr.
Robert Q. Williams*

*Nathan Ballentine
Gary E. Clary
Kirkman Finlay III
Joseph H. Jefferson Jr.
Walton J. McLeod
Joshua Putnam
Samuel Rivers Jr.
Tommy M. Stringer
Bill Taylor*

South Carolina House of Representatives

*Jennifer L. Dobson
Research Director*

*Cathy A. Greer
Administration Coordinator*

**Post Office Box 11867
Columbia, South Carolina 29211
Telephone: (803) 212-6810 • Fax: (803) 212-6811
Room 228 Blatt Building**

*Charles L. Appleby IV
Legal Counsel*

**Ad Hoc Committee - Other Study No. 1
September 30, 2015
10:00 a.m. - 1:00 p.m.
Room 102 - Blatt Building**

ARCHIVED VIDEO

- I. You may access archived video of this meeting by visiting the South Carolina General Assembly's website (<http://www.scstatehouse.gov>) and click on "Committee Postings and Reports," then under House Standing Committees click on "Legislative Oversight". Lastly, click on "Video Archives" for a listing of archived videos for the Legislative Oversight Committee.

MINUTES

- I. House Rule 4.5 requires the standing committees of the House to prepare and make available for public inspection, in compliance with Section 30-4-90, the minutes of full committee meetings. House Rule 4.5 further provides that such minutes need not be verbatim accounts of such meetings.
- II. On August 26, 2015, a motion was adopted for the House Oversight Committee to commence an investigation into state agencies, including, but not limited to the Department of Social Services, the Department of Health and Environmental Control, and the Department of Health and Human Services, relationship with, funding of, and other activities relating to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in South Carolina.
- III. Pursuant to Committee Rule 6.1, an ad hoc committee was appointed to undertake the study as stated in the motion.
- IV. Pursuant to Committee Rule 6.3, on September 3, 2015, the Legislative Oversight Committee Chair appointed the members and chair of the ad hoc committee. The members include the Honorable Nathan Ballentine, the Honorable Raye Felder, the Honorable Mia S. McLeod, the Honorable Walton J. McLeod, the Honorable Robert Ridgeway, III, the Honorable James E. Smith, Jr., the Honorable

Tommy M. Stringer, and the Honorable Bill Taylor. The chair of the ad hoc committee is the Honorable Gary E. Clary.

- V. The ad hoc committee (Committee) was called to order at 10:03 a.m. by Chairman Gary E. Clary on Tuesday, September 30, 2015, in Room 102 of the Blatt Building, Columbia, South Carolina. Chairman Clary made brief welcoming remarks; stated the meeting would end at 1:00 p.m.; stated the motion and emphasized the study was of the agencies relationship with, funding of and other activities, it was not a study of Planned Parenthood or other abortion providers; and explained the Committee’s expectations of the agencies under study. All Members were present at the start of the meeting, except for the Honorable Mia S. McLeod and the Honorable Walton J. McLeod. The Honorable Mia S. McLeod arrived during the questioning of the Department of Social Services (DSS) and the Honorable Walton J. McLeod arrived at the conclusion of the questioning of DSS and prior to the presentation by the Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS).
- VI. Chairman Clary then explained that testimony given to the ad hoc committee must be under oath and then swore in all agency individuals, not a part of the General Assembly, that might answer a question, or make comments directly to the ad hoc committee. The following individuals from their respective agencies were sworn in: (1) Tony Canton (General Counsel for DSS); (2) Barbara Derrick (Deputy Director of Administration for DSS); (3) Susan Alford (Director of DSS); (4) Christian Soura (Director of DHHS); and (5) Catherine Heigel (Director of the Department of Health and Environmental Control (DHEC)). Representatives from the General Assembly’s Legislative Audit Council (LAC) were not sworn in: Marcia Lindsay (Deputy Director) and John Kresslein (Senior Auditor).
- VII. After swearing in the agency representatives, Chairman Clary explained the plan for the ad hoc committee, which is stated in the Committee’s Standard Practices and includes: (1) Conducting initial meetings with the agencies to obtain information as well as, upon a motion, utilize any other tools available to the ad hoc committee; (2) After obtaining the information, Committee staff summarizing the information in a Committee Staff Study; (3) Upon receipt of the Committee staff study, Committee members meeting to discuss and vote on any Committee recommendations; and (4) Submitting the Committee’s study, with any recommendations, to the full Legislative Oversight Committee. Chairman Clary then began the study of DSS’ relationship with, funding of and other activities relating to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in South Carolina.
- VIII. Susan Alford testified on behalf of DSS, and she stated that DSS did not have any presentation or opening remarks for the Committee. Chairman Clary then went through nine yes or no questions, which had been provided to each agency in advance to enable them to perform any research needed to adequately respond to the questions. DSS responded as follows to the questions:

What, if any, RELATIONSHIP the agency has with Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
Question	Yes	No
1) Are there any state or federal <u>statutes that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
2) Are there any state or federal <u>regulations that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X

3) Are there any <u>standard practices of the agency that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
What, if any, FUNDING the agency has or provides Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
4) Does the agency <u>receive any funding</u> or monies related to abortions from Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
5) Does the agency <u>directly provide any funding</u> related to abortions to Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
6) Does the agency <u>provide others</u> (i.e. individuals, agencies or entities) <u>funding that is intended to go toward</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
7) Does the agency provide others (i.e individuals, agencies or entities) <u>funding that, to the agency's knowledge, has a chance of going toward</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
What, if any, OTHER ACTIVITIES OF THE AGENCY RELATE to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
8) Do any of the agencies <u>activities directly relate to</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
9) Do any of the agencies <u>activities indirectly relate to</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	

Director Alford explained the agency's activities which indirectly relate to abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina involves South Carolina laws related to "judicial bypass." Pursuant to South Carolina Code of Laws Section 44-41-32, upon request, DSS must assist a minor in filing a petition to the court to obtain an order granting the minor the right to obtain an abortion without parental or guardian consent. Committee members asked follow up questions related to judicial bypass which Director Alford answered directly or stated she could obtain information which would be responsive to the request.

At the conclusion of the Committee members' questions of DSS, Chairman Clary made a motion that Committee staff follow up with DSS to obtain the following information:

- Number of requests received for judicial bypass each of the last five years; and
- Number of requests for judicial bypass granted by the court each of the last five years.

Under Mason's Rules, this motion did not need a second. There was no discussion, and the roll call vote was as follows:

Rep. Clary's Motion for Committee Staff to follow up with DSS to obtain the additional information sought by Committee Members:	Yea	Nay	Not Voting
1. Nathan Ballentine	X		
2. Raye Felder	X		
3. Mia S. McLeod	X		
4. Walton J. McLeod			(not present)
5. Robert L. Ridgeway, III	X		
6. James E. Smith, Jr.	X		

7. Tommy M. Stringer	X		
8. Bill Taylor	X		
9. Gary E. Clary	X		

The motion passed. Next, Chairman Clary began the study of DHHS' relationship with, funding of and other activities relating to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in South Carolina.

IX. Christian Soura testified on behalf of DHHS and provided a PowerPoint presentation which addressed federal oversight of Medicaid, provider relationship, funding for abortions/Planned Parenthood and closing thoughts. At the conclusion of Mr. Soura's presentation, Chairman Clary went through nine yes or no questions, which had been provided to each agency in advance to enable them to perform any research needed to adequately respond to the questions. DHHS responded as follows to the questions:

What, if any, RELATIONSHIP the agency has with Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?			
Question	Yes	No	
1) Are there any state or federal <u>statutes that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
2) Are there any state or federal <u>regulations that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
3) Are there any <u>standard practices of the agency that require</u> personnel at the agency to communicate (talk with in person, over the phone, reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
What, if any, FUNDING the agency has or provides Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?			
4) Does the agency <u>receive any funding</u> or monies related to abortions from Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
5) Does the agency <u>directly provide any funding</u> related to abortions to Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
6) Does the agency <u>provide others</u> (i.e. individuals, agencies or entities) <u>funding that is intended to go toward</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
7) Does the agency provide others (i.e individuals, agencies or entities) <u>funding that, to the agency's knowledge, has a chance of going toward</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
What, if any, OTHER ACTIVITIES OF THE AGENCY RELATE to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?			
8) Do any of the agencies <u>activities directly relate to</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		
9) Do any of the agencies <u>activities indirectly relate to</u> abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X		

Chairman Clary then asked a few additional questions before opening the floor to questions from other Committee Members. Committee members asked additional questions which Director Soura answered directly or stated he could obtain information which would be responsive to the request.

At the conclusion of the Committee members' questions of DHHS, Chairman Clary made a motion that Committee staff follow up with DHHS to obtain the following information:

- Documentation which shows the investigation and final determination of the two potential abortions at Planned Parenthood paid through Medicaid which were discovered by your agency yesterday afternoon;
- Number of abortions paid through Medicaid which are within the Hyde Amendment during FY 2011 through FY 2015 broken down by Option 1 (if the pregnancy is the result of an act of rape or incest) and Option 2 (if the pregnancy would place the woman in danger of death unless an abortion is performed);
- List of cities, counties and zip codes in which the 222 abortions paid through Medicaid during FY 2011 through FY 2015 were performed based on the address you have for the provider; and
- Number of individuals under the age of seventeen who have obtained abortions paid through Medicaid during FY 2011 through FY 2015.

Under Mason's Rules, this motion did not need a second. There was no discussion, and the roll call vote was as follows:

Rep. Clary's Motion for Committee Staff to follow up with DHHS to obtain the additional information sought by Committee Members:	Yea	Nay	Not Voting
1. Nathan Ballentine	X		
2. Raye Felder			(not present at time of vote)
3. Mia S. McLeod	X		
4. Walton J. McLeod	X		
5. Robert L. Ridgeway, III	X		
6. James E. Smith, Jr.	X		
7. Tommy M. Stringer	X		
8. Bill Taylor	X		
9. Gary E. Clary	X		

The motion passed. Next, Chairman Clary had the Committee take a short 10 minute recess; at this point, the meeting had been in progress for approximately two hours.

When the Committee returned from the recess, Chairman Clary requested representatives from LAC come forward to provide information about their report, "A Review of the S.C. Department of Health and Environmental Control's Regulation of Abortion Clinics," and their knowledge of DHEC.

- X. Marcia Lindsay and Jack Kresslein spoke for LAC, and Ms. Lindsay stated their report was their opening remarks. Chairman Clary then went through nine yes or no questions regarding LAC's knowledge of DHEC based of LAC's investigation. LAC was provided the questions in advance to enable them to perform any research needed to adequately respond to the questions. LAC responded as follows to the questions:

What, if any, RELATIONSHIP the agency has with Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
Question	Yes	No
1) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any state or federal statutes that require personnel at DHEC to communicate (i.e. talking over the phone, meeting in person, providing reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	
2) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any state or federal regulations that require personnel at DHEC to communicate (i.e. talking over the phone, meeting in person, providing reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	
3) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any standard practices at DHEC that require personnel at the agency to communicate (i.e. talking over the phone, meeting in person, providing reports, etc.) about abortions with Planned Parenthood, or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	
What, if any, FUNDING the agency has or provides Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
4) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any funding or monies DHEC receives which are related to abortions from Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	
5) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know if DHEC directly provides any funding related to abortions to Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
6) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know if DHEC provides other individuals, agencies or entities funding that is intended to go toward abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
7) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know if DHEC provides other individuals, agencies or entities funding that, DHEC may or should know, has a chance of going toward abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X
What, if any, OTHER ACTIVITIES OF THE AGENCY RELATE to Planned Parenthood facilities and other abortion providers in SC?		
8) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any DHEC activities that directly relate to abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?	X	
9) Based on LAC's investigation, does LAC know of any DHEC activities that indirectly relate to abortions at Planned Parenthood or any other abortion providers in South Carolina?		X

Chairman Clary opened the floor to questions from other Committee Members. Committee members asked additional questions which LAC representatives answered directly or stated they could obtain information which would be responsive to the request.

At the conclusion of the Committee members' questions of LAC, Chairman Clary made a motion that the committee conclude LAC's involvement in the ad hoc committee's study, unless, during the remainder of the study, committee members learned additional information for which they needed to follow up with LAC.

Under Mason's Rules, this motion did not need a second. There was no discussion, and the roll call vote was as follows:

Rep. Clary’s Motion that the Committee conclude LAC’s involvement in the ad hoc committee’s study, unless during the remainder of the study, committee members learned additional information for which they needed to follow up with LAC.	Yea	Nay	Not Voting
1. Nathan Ballentine	X		
2. Raye Felder	X		
3. Mia S. McLeod	X		
4. Walton J. McLeod	X		
5. Robert L. Ridgeway, III	X		
6. James E. Smith, Jr.	X		
7. Tommy M. Stringer	X		
8. Bill Taylor	X		
9. Gary E. Clary	X		

The motion passed. Next, Chairman Clary stated there were only about 15 minutes left in the meeting, explained the next Committee meeting would be held on November 12, 2015, and asked representatives from DHEC if they would like to make any comments during the remaining time in response to the information LAC had provided about DHEC.

- XI. Catherine Heigel testified on behalf of DHEC. As she came forward, Chairman Clary noted DHEC had provided the Committee with a large notebook of information and was prepared to make a full presentation; however, due to the length of time it took to get through the other agencies, the full presentation would need to wait until the next meeting. Ms. Heigel thanked the Committee for the opportunity to respond to the statements made by LAC and provided a brief response. After her response, committee members asked a few quick questions, to which Ms. Heigel answered directly.
- XII. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:00 p.m.